

## MEMORANDUM

**TO:** Alison Ashe-Card, Board Liaison  
**FROM:** Beth Maoui, JD Career Advisors Section Chair  
**CC:** Claire Nash  
**DATE:** February 1, 2023  
**RE:** NALP JD Career Advisors Section Third Quarterly Report

---

### I. SUMMARY OF ACTIVITIES

On Wednesday, October 26, 2022 (11:00 a.m. PT/2:00 p.m. ET), we held our third JD Career Advisors (“JDCA”) section meeting for 2022-2023 via Zoom. Approximately 20 members attended the Zoom meeting. After welcome greetings by the chair, all of the meeting attendees introduced themselves to the group and provided an update on their fall and the latest with their career advisor roles, law students, and law schools. Some highlights from the group introductions:

- Some members cited increased bar passage rates for their students.
- Some schools are short on career services staff. At one school, career services meets with all 250 3Ls.
- Some individual schools were busy this fall with the following:
  - Holding a professional development conference over a weekend attended by hundreds of its students.
  - Hosting a spotlight on small firm practitioners.
  - Organizing for credit pass/fail professional development course taught by adjunct professors.
  - Hosting a career exploration series that consists of four panels and students must attend one each day.
  - Organizing free coffee and donuts in its office suite to attract students.

Breakout rooms were not necessary because of the smaller number of attendees.

After introductions, several work groups shared updates with the JDCA section:

- JDCA Annual Education Conference (“AEC”) / Bulletin+ Article and Webinar Planning Update: Tom Lee (Penn State Dickinson Law) provided an update on JDCA submitted articles (seven total) and a webinar (being organized by George Podolin (William & Mary Law School)).
- JD Advantage (“JDA”) Update: Kathy Greenier (University of Richmond School of Law) & Quaimee Lee (Northeastern Law) updated the JDCA section about the latest with JDA, including these three projects: (i) the JD Advantage Career Guide, (ii) the annual JD Advantage Career Week, and (iii) Advisor Well-Being Speaker/Event.

We also had a group discussion of “hot topics” facing us as JD career advisors, which included the following:

1. Topic 1: 1L Counseling

- Are there any trends you are noticing with the 1L class (class of 2025)? Any change in career interests (e.g., less interested in public interest)?
- First-year law students (class of 2025) seem more focused on their personal debt (largely educational debt) and earning a high income after law school than prior recent classes; and this seems to be a key factor (or the main factor) in their decision to attend law school.
- Do you see an increase in not knowing “why law school”? Do 1Ls seem less knowledgeable about legal careers?

Group Feedback: The group discussed that there seems to be an uptick in student concern over student debt. The group also discussed in depth the “Covid effect,” which seems to impact the students in several ways. Many of the 1Ls seem to have less work experience prior to law school or graduated college early (so perhaps less life experience) than prior law school classes. One counselor also pointed out that some 1Ls actually seemed to have less anxiety and/or a false sense (or inflated sense) of their abilities.

2. Topic 2: Issues with law students reading their e-mails from career services. At one school, students did not know about the law school’s OCI despite announcing the program in class and sending e-mail messages.

- Any tricks to get students to read e-mail?
- Any other communication ideas? There was a NALPconnect post yesterday (from Sarah Beznoska, Cleveland-Marshall College of Law, Cleveland State University) on a “discussion board” resource for students.

Group Feedback: The group discussed different approaches that their law schools and offices take to communicate effectively with students and teach students how to read e-mails. At several schools, there is some training on reading e-mail as part of law students’ curriculum (such as teaching students to sift through, organize, and read e-mail). At some schools, students have complained about the use of e-mail.

The group also discussed the significant number of “no show” law students at school events. At one school, if you RSVP and then miss the event, you will receive a call and a discussion of the expectations for the event. At another school, you must RSVP and check in to eat the event’s food.

Kathy Greenier (University of Richmond School of Law) shared how at New York University’s engineering program, they use messaging around the “uniqueness” and “specialness” of the career resources being offered, which has been successful in increasing student engagement with career services. The idea would be to emphasize the exclusivity, value, and privilege to have access to law school career services to encourage student use and engagement.

3. Topic 3: How to best facilitate employers who want to engage with students on-campus. At some schools, there is a big uptick in employers wanting to find more opportunities to engage with students.

- What are schools doing? Are you having one large event with multiple employers? Encouraging employers to do events off campus (or facilitating events on campus)?

- 1L Biglaw Diversity Hiring: This fall, at some schools, there is an uptick in biglaw employers trying to engage with first-year law students in connection with 1L biglaw diversity applications. The issue is how to balance (i) employer interest in connecting with 1Ls and 1Ls' interest in connecting with employers with (ii) the need for 1Ls to focus on their academic studies rather than job search activities to earn the law school grades that many biglaw firms require to hire students. Are there law firm events in October and November? Or are there more events during winter break (home for the holidays events)?

Group Feedback: The group did not have time to discuss this topic.

At the end of the meeting, I reminded members that our next JDCA quarterly meeting will be held on Wednesday, January 18, 11:00 PT/2:00 ET.

**I later moved the next JDCA quarterly meeting to Thursday, February 2, 2023 at 2 p.m. ET/1 p.m. CT/11 a.m. PT**, which I posted in NALPconnect. I moved the date because I received some member feedback suggesting that we move our JDCA meetings to a different day of the week (we have only had Wednesday meetings to date) to possibly enable more attendance from those who could not previously make Wednesdays due to a recurring staff meeting or the like.

\*For next year's JDCA meetings, I suggest that the JDCA section chair(s) vary the days of the week for each JDCA meeting to prevent picking one day that will never work for some JDCA members.

The February 2<sup>nd</sup> JDCA section meeting is the fourth and final meeting of this term.

## **II. JDCA WORK GROUPS**

The following are updates on the JDCA work groups provided by each work group's vice chair(s):

### **1. Annual Education Conference / Bulletin+ Article and Webinar Planning (Vice Chair(s): Tom Lee, Penn State Dickinson Law, [thomas.lee@psu.edu](mailto:thomas.lee@psu.edu))**

Tom helped to solicit six article proposals and one webinar program. Prior to the July 18th deadline, JD Career Advisors submitted its proposed Bulletin+ articles to NALP's Andrew Parker. Mary Beal approved the proposed webinar, which is slated for early 2023. Three of the proposed articles are "nuts and bolts" pieces that are 500-700 words in length. The other three articles are feature length articles that run up to 1000 words in length. Tom has not heard from Andrew Parker as to which month each article is scheduled for publication, if any. The webinar is scheduled for less than one hour.

### Summary of the JD Career Advisor Articles and Webinar

#### **Articles and Columns**

<b>Author(s) Name, Email</b>	<b>Topic</b>
Carole Tillotson (Drake) <a href="mailto:carole.tillotson@drake.edu">carole.tillotson@drake.edu</a>	Resumes, Cover Letters and Diversity Statements— what employers want and what schools see (recruiting co-authors)
Dina Billan (Baltimore) <a href="mailto:dbillan@ubalt.edu">dbillan@ubalt.edu</a>	Counsel Students and Alumni to Be Their Own Staffing Agency (seeks co-author)

Dina Billan (Baltimore) <a href="mailto:dbillian@ubalt.edu">dbillian@ubalt.edu</a>	Encouraging the Use of Positive Psychology in the Job Search Process (seeks co-author)
--	--

## Feature Articles

Author(s) Name, Email	Topic
Betsy Key (Vanderbilt) <a href="mailto:elizabeth.b.key@vanderbilt.edu">elizabeth.b.key@vanderbilt.edu</a> ; Cliff Jarrett (W&L) <a href="mailto:jarrettc@wlu.edu">jarrettc@wlu.edu</a>	Mock interview program, and my article idea is to contrast two different programs – Vanderbilt and W&L – as a discussion around the impact of how these programs are structured. Vanderbilt is a 1L program offered over winter break and is run like OCI. W&L offers their program over the 1L summer and is structured for students to reach out to their chosen alumnus on their own, meeting professionals in the market the student is spending the summer.
Christopher Neal, Esq. (Temple); Tammy O’Hara (NYLS) <a href="mailto:christopher.neal@temple.edu">christopher.neal@temple.edu</a> ; <a href="mailto:tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu">tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu</a>	The Life-Cycle for Career Advising First Generation Law Students
Amy Mattock (Georgetown) <a href="mailto:asj6@georgetown.edu">asj6@georgetown.edu</a> [and] co-authors are being recruited.	Pulling Back the Curtain on Law Firm Diversity, Equity & Inclusion: What’s Marketing and What’s Real? (recruiting co-authors or solo)

## Webinar

Author(s) Name, Email	Topic
George Podolin (William and Mary) [and] panel in formation. <a href="mailto:gppodolin@wm.edu">gppodolin@wm.edu</a>	Webinar based upon George’s NALP Bulletin+ article “Working With Students Who Reneg.”

### 2. CSO Employer Outreach (Vice Chair: Ruby Sheikh, Georgetown Law, [ris6@georgetown.edu](mailto:ris6@georgetown.edu))

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, no update was provided by this work group. Work group Vice Chair Carole Yeats (University of Richmond Law School) had to resign from this role this year due to other commitments.

### 3. JD Counseling (Vice Chair(s): Lorelei Craig, University of Oregon, [lcraig@uoregon.edu](mailto:lcraig@uoregon.edu), and Katie Shaw Rabinowitz, Colorado Law, [Katie.Rabinowitz@Colorado.edu](mailto:Katie.Rabinowitz@Colorado.edu) (formerly Temple Law))

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, no update was provided by this work group.

### 4. First Generation College Students (Vice Chair(s): Tammy O’Hara, New York Law School, [tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu](mailto:tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu), and Chris Neal, Temple Law School, [christopher.neal@temple.edu](mailto:christopher.neal@temple.edu))

Chris Neal reports that progress has been slow for this quarter because his co-vice chair has not responded to emails since August. Chris plans to continue to write the article that his work group proposed, which was selected for the Bulletin and is due in April 2023.

**5. JD Advantage Careers (Vice Chair(s): Quaime Lee, Northeastern University School of Law, [g.lee@northeastern.edu](mailto:g.lee@northeastern.edu), and Kathy Greenier, University of Richmond, [kgreenier@richmond.edu](mailto:kgreenier@richmond.edu))**

During this period, this work group held meetings on October 19, 2022 and December 14, 2022.

The work group has identified three charges and are working with work group volunteers to deliver on them by the end of the academic year:

- (1) A second JD Advantage Career Week for spring 2023;
- (2) An update to the 2020 [\*NALP JD Advantage Career Guide\*](#); and
- (3) Organizing and delivering a program on advisor wellness/well-being for spring 2023.

Over the past week, the vice chairs have been reaching out to volunteers to organize mini-groups to tackle these projects.

The next JD Advantage meeting is scheduled for February 15 at 1:30 p.m. EST.

**6. Recruitment Tools Evaluation (Vice Chair(s): Lauren Jackson, Howard University School of Law, [lauren.jackson@law.howard.edu](mailto:lauren.jackson@law.howard.edu))**

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, the vice chair, Lauren Jackson, reports that there are no updates at this time for the work group.

**7. UBE Score Portability (Vice Chair(s): Kimberly Underdown of St. Mary's University School of Law, [kunderdown@stmarytx.edu](mailto:kunderdown@stmarytx.edu))**

On April 27, George Podolin provided me with the word document of this chart. The document was last updated in 2018. The data in the chart is currently under review and being revised as needed. Once the data is updated, we will submit to NALP to get the website updated as well.

**8. Legal Internship Guide (Vice Chair(s): Marcie Y. Davis, Dedman School of Law, Southern Methodist University, [mydavis@smu.edu](mailto:mydavis@smu.edu), and Tami Diebel, Iowa College of Law, [tami-diebel@uiowa.edu](mailto:tami-diebel@uiowa.edu))**

Tami and Marcie collaborated to draft the Legal Internship Guide. The vice chairs shared the draft with colleagues at different schools and with a corporate employer. They received feedback and have incorporated it into their draft. While they have circulated the guide to a few other friends and are editing and refining as they go, for the most part, they consider the Legal Internship Guide finished and the vice chairs will meet one more time next month.

After this meeting, they believe they are ready for NALP's next steps. Alison Ashe-Card has advised that the final step would be to e-mail the guide to Mary Beal ([mbeal@nalp.org](mailto:mbeal@nalp.org)) and Fred Thrasher ([fthrasher@nalp.org](mailto:fthrasher@nalp.org)) and copy Alison and Beth Maoui on the email.

**9. Member Relations (Vice Chair(s): Felipe Alonso III, University of Oregon School of Law, [falonso@uoregon.edu](mailto:falonso@uoregon.edu))**

From October 16, 2022 to January 24, 2023, twenty-eight (28) new members joined the section and five (5) left. The Vice Chair sent an email to all new members welcoming them to the group, inviting them to join the quarterly meetings, directing them to review NALPconnect, and reach out with any questions.

**10. Knowledge Management and Resource Implementation (No Vice Chair volunteers)**

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, there are no volunteers for this work group. The stated purpose of this group is to: “Identify top resources relevant to the section and collaborate with the NALP staff to explore location options for the compilation to provide easy access.”

Upon the advice of Board Liaison, Alison Ashe-Card, the JDCA co-chairs asked the JDCA work group vice chairs to coordinate with the JDCA co-chairs and Alison to make sure that any resources that they create are made accessible to NALP members. Vice chairs are welcome to share these resources on NALPconnect as well.

**11. DEI Liaison (Vice Chair(s): Nicole Netkin-Collins, Villanova Law, [nicole.netkincollins@law.villanova.edu](mailto:nicole.netkincollins@law.villanova.edu))**

The DEI liaison from the Diversity Standing Committee, Nicole Netkin-Collins, attended the JDCA section meeting on October 26, 2022. Nicole notes that the Diversity Standing Committee will be meeting in-person in Washington, D.C. in March 2023 and may have more to report, including action items moving forward, after that meeting.

**12. Well-Being Champion ((Vice Chair(s): Kimberly Underdown of St. Mary's University School of Law, [kunderdown@stmarytx.edu](mailto:kunderdown@stmarytx.edu))**

Well-Being Champions met on January 27 and I was not able to attend the meeting. I have requested a recap of the meeting from the group leaders.

**13. Communications, Social Media & Marketing (No Vice Chair volunteers)**

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, there are no volunteers for this work group. Note that no Vice Chairs served in this role in 2021-2022. The stated purpose of this group is to: “Develop at least four (quarterly) social media posts to share with the NALP staff and conduct monthly member outreach on NALPconnect to update the membership about the work of the group.”

Upon the advice of Board Liaison, Alison Ashe-Card, the JDCA co-chairs encouraged the JDCA work group vice chairs to post what their work group is doing on NALPconnect. As of the date of this Quarterly Report, there was a total of 11 posts by the JDCA co-chairs and vice chairs on NALPconnect for the quarter.

### **III. ENVIRONMENTAL SCANNING**

Between the October 26, 2022 JDCA meeting and collecting items for the meeting agenda for the next JDCA meeting on February 2, 2023, the following JD career advising topics and issues were discussed and/or shared:

- See the three topics discussed on pgs. 2-3 above.
- Many 1L biglaw diversity programs require a “personal statement” or “diversity statement.” Some JDCA members report that there is an increase of students discussing personal medical issues, neurodiversity, and/or past drug use. There is an uptick in the number of students sharing a “disability” as their diversity. When they receive these diversity statements, they have concerns.
- Members cite an uptick in the number of students who tell you that they “didn't know” or “weren't told” about things that the CSO has covered in required sessions, emails, flyers, announcements, etc.
- Several schools report that students are turned off or refuse to take biglaw “assessment tests” (such as Suited), which conflicts with the strong desire of some firms to use assessment tests to evaluate candidates with different metrics as well as reduce bias in hiring.
- There seems to be an increase in 1Ls who only want to work in the private sector for their 1L summer (and many are particularly focused on 1L biglaw diversity programs). Counselors are concerned with how to manage the expectations of these students and ensure that they have a back-up plan for their 1L summer job.
- Discussions at the January 2023 NALP Legal Recruiting Summit point to earlier and earlier recruiting this summer. Members are concerned with how students will navigate their 1L summer jobs while possibly interviewing earlier in the summer, and potentially ending their summer jobs earlier for OCI.
- If students receive offers from biglaw firms earlier this summer (as seems to be likely), will biglaw firms limit the offer window and how will this impact students' abilities to evaluate and choose firms.

### **IV. WORK GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS TO NALP**

Based on my term as JDCA section chair since spring 2022, I believe the JDCA section suffers from too many work groups and that NALP law school members are stretched too thin. As the chair of the JDCA section, I was responsible for 13 work groups, which I find unreasonable. The existence of too many work groups eats away at the value and productivity of the section as a whole. Also, the high number of work groups burdens the JDCA section chair, which likely drives past and future section chairs away from volunteering with NALP. I would not want my successor to be responsible for 13 work groups and notably, several of the work groups did not produce any work. This section should consider less work groups not more.

I recommend that the following JDCA work groups be discontinued for the 2023-2024 program year:

- 1. CSO Employer Outreach.** The stated purpose was: *“This group should continue its work on employer background checks by reviewing survey and outreach results and determine the best way to disseminate this analysis to the membership. The goal of this group is to bring together colleagues who regularly counsel law students and alumni. It will identify current counseling “hot topics”, key resources and develop articles and programs to address them.”*

From last year’s 2022 JDCA reports, it looks like there was a completed Law Firm Background Check survey. For this year, I have not have not seen any progress on the charge of the work group, which makes me question the interest and desire behind this project. From the group’s updates, it also appears like the work group struggled to find other interested members. I also think some of this group’s purpose could be covered by members in other NALP sections, such as NALP’s Recruiting section. I think there should not be too many duplicative work groups across NALP sections.

- 2. Recruitment Tools Evaluation.** The stated purpose was: *“Develop and update an education guide about the use of assessment tools considering inclusion issues such as implicit bias, ADA, privacy concerns, and data ownership, and create a corresponding distribution plan.”*

For the three quarterly reports, there have been no updates provided so it is unclear if any guide has been started or any progress has been made. If no work has been done, I am not sure it makes sense to carry this group forward for another year unless a NALP member (or the current work group chair) has a strong interest in continuing this project. I also did not see much or any progress made by this work group last year.

In the NALP Business Plan, this is a work group that collaborates with the same group in NALP’s Recruiting section. I suggest that this group be solely the responsibility of the Recruiting section. It seems that work groups may struggle when they are shared across sections.

- 3. UBE Score Portability.** The stated purpose was: *“Update the ‘UBE Score Portability Cheat Sheet’.”*

This work group should be discontinued because I believe that the “UBE Score Portability Cheat Sheet” will be finished at the end of the term.

- 4. Legal Internship Guide.** The stated purpose was: *“Create a brief guide on the requirements and considerations for an effective legal internship program for employers new to hiring law students. If appropriate, create that brief guide in a template form that members could adapt to their own schools and markets and provide to potential internship employers.”*

This work group should be discontinued because the Legal Internship Guide will be finished at the end of the term.

- 5. Knowledge Management and Resource Implementation.** The stated purpose was: *“Identify top resources relevant to the section and collaborate with the NALP staff to explore location options for the compilation to provide easy access.”*

This work group should be discontinued because there were no vice chair volunteers (after persistent requests for volunteers). It is also unclear to me if this work group did any work for the prior term. Because of the lack of interest in this work group, I would encourage NALP staff to internally work on NALP's knowledge management and resource implementation.

6. **Communications, Social Media & Marketing.** The stated purpose was: *“Develop at least four (quarterly) social media posts to share with the NALP staff and conduct monthly member outreach on NALPconnect to update the membership about the work of the group.”*

This work group should be discontinued because there were no vice chair volunteers (after persistent requests for volunteers). Because of the lack of interest in this work group, I would encourage NALP staff to think of other ways to increase social media posts. I have received feedback from JDCA members that they are not interested in this social media charge.