

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Alison Ashe-Card, Board Liaison

FROM: Beth Maoui, JD Career Advisors Section Chair

CC: Claire Nash

DATE: April 5, 2023

RE: NALP JD Career Advisors Section Fourth Quarterly Report

### I. SUMMARY OF ACTIVITIES

On Thursday, February 2, 2023 (11:00 PT/2:00 ET), we held our fourth JD Career Advisors (“JDCA”) section meeting for the 2022-2023 term via Zoom. Approximately 25 members attended the Zoom meeting. After introductions, two work groups shared updates with the JDCA section:

- JDCA Annual Education Conference (“AEC”) / Bulletin+ Article and Webinar Planning Update: Tom Lee (Penn State Dickinson Law) provided an update on JDCA submitted articles and a webinar (being organized by George Podolin (William & Mary Law School)).
- JD Advantage (“JDA”) Update: Kathy Greenier (University of Richmond School of Law) & Quaime Lee (Northeastern Law) updated the JDCA section about the latest with JDA, including their latest three charges: (i) a second JDA Career Week for spring 2023, (ii) an update to the 2020 NALP JD Advantage Career Guide, and (iii) organizing and delivering a program on advisor wellness/well-being for spring 2023.

2023 NALP Legal Recruiting Summit. Next, Beth Maoui shared some key takeaways from the 2023 NALP Legal Recruiting Summit (held in New York on Tuesday, January 24, 2023). These key takeaways included:

- On-Campus Recruiting: 2009 – lowest on-campus recruiting levels; 2021 – highest on-campus recruiting levels (46% firms/offices reported an increase in campus visits). 2022 (42%) still a robust hiring year.
- Return Offer/Acceptance Rate: In 2022, they remain at historically high levels (98% offer rate, 89% acceptance rate).
- 1L Hiring: For 2022, 94% of 1Ls received a return offer and 73% of 1Ls accepted the return offer.
- 3L Hiring: Fall recruiting of 3Ls remains pretty low (in 2022, it was 14% of firms/offices recruiting 3Ls) compared to pre-recession (height of 53% of firms/offices in 2006).
- Precruiting: 34% of offices made pre-OCI offers. Precruiting happened the MOST in the Northeast (55.4%) and the LEAST in the West/Rocky Mountain region (22.7%).
- Use of Non-Interview Assessment Tools: Only 13% of offices reported that they used assessment tools. But offices in the West/Rocky Mountain were the most likely to report using non-interview assessment tools (17%) while offices in the Southeast were least likely (7%). There was robust discussion at the Legal Recruiting Summit of some firms’ strong

interest in using assessment tools vs. law students' dislike of assessment tools (which was shared during the Summit's law student panel).

- Recruiting in a Post-Dobbs World: Speaker Sara Dana (Harvard Law) provided an overview of how Harvard law students are holding biglaw firms accountable on issues like climate and gun control. Now students may consider how firms react to the Supreme Court's Dobbs decision overturning of Roe v. Wade. Of the 100 AmLaw firms, 76 firms have offices in states where abortion is banned/severely restricted. (The JDCA section subsequently discussed how students at Harvard may have more power and ability to hold firms accountable on these issues than students at most other law schools. And not all students would feel comfortable and able to (or have the opportunity to ask) a firm about these policies.)

Tom Lee (Penn State Dickinson Law) also shared some feedback and highlights from the Summit, including:

- The majority of on-campus recruiting screening/initial interviews are being held virtually, with most callbacks or second looks being in person.

Hot Topics: We also had a group discussion of "hot topics" facing us as JD career advisors, which included the following:

1. Topic 1: 1L Summer Jobs. *A good number of 1Ls haven't applied to any jobs and seem to be unable to start applying. How much CSO/counselor intervention is necessary? There also seems to be an increase in 1Ls who only want to work in the private sector for their 1L summer (and many are particularly focused on 1L biglaw diversity programs). Counselors are concerned with how to manage the expectations of these students and ensure that they have a back-up plan for their 1L summer job.*
  - *At what point do you advise students to broaden their search?*
  - *Any advice for 1Ls looking for jobs in late spring, early summer?*

Group Feedback: This meeting discussion was held on February 2 and some schools noted that it was still early in the semester for their 1Ls' job search and their students look for positions in March and later in the semester.

There was a robust discussion of "executive functioning" for 1Ls and the need to train law students on retaining information, taking initiative, navigating their e-mail, and more. One school mentioned that we should be cognizant of the number of databases and resources that the students use daily, which may make it more overwhelming to use CSO resources. The law students also have more activities in law school than students 10-20 years ago, and their attention is more divided. One school also mentioned that some law students have underlying emotional and mental issues. There is also the idea that some experience imposter syndrome.

As part of their job search decision-making, some 1Ls may have "FOMO" and overthink the opportunities they have for this summer due to anxiety and fear of making the wrong decision. In choosing a 1L summer position, it is important to emphasize to 1Ls that there is no "perfect 1L summer job" and emphasize the transferable skills that they will gain from a legal job (whether it be in the private sector or public sector). Also, the 1L summer job is one just one job, and counselors should remind students that they can gain experience during the academic year via an externship and/or clinic.

Also, the group discussed the importance of emphasizing to students that careers are often a “squiggly line” and not linear. The majority of 1Ls’ prior experience has all been linear (high school to college to law school) but professional careers are rarely perfectly linear. Many of the students come straight from school so there is this idea of “path dependence,” or “linear progression.” They are good at identifying the next step but not always good at flexibility, and they should be reminded of this. This was a very full discussion by the group, which many members participated in.

The schools also discussed the ways in which they help students locate and apply to jobs. Some schools send students specific jobs to facilitate their job search. Other schools provide a list of employers.

2. *Topic 2: 1L Biglaw Diversity Programs – Discussion of Application Materials. Many 1L biglaw diversity programs require a “personal statement” or “diversity statement.” Some examples of job posting language are: “Your diversity statement should be 500 words or less and describe how you would contribute to the diversity of the law firm’s practice and culture and what you believe demonstrates your qualifications.” or “Personal statement (500 to 1,000 words) addressing one or more of the following: (i) Your resilience and tenacity. (ii) How you will contribute to the firm’s inclusive culture and diverse community, and (iii) Experiences that have shaped your commitment to inclusion, diversity, and belonging in the legal profession.”*

*Some JDCA members have shared that there is an increase of students discussing personal medical issues, neurodiversity, and past drug use. There is an uptick in the number of students sharing a “disability” as their diversity. When they receive these diversity statements, they have concerns and do not know how to advise. Has anyone seen this as well? Does anyone have any views on this and how to advise 1Ls on these statements?*

**Group Feedback:** The group had limited time to discuss this topic but there was a strong interest in this topic. Some schools are concerned that these statements are asking for “trauma porn” and may be taking advantage of students’ personal experiences. Another school commented that they tell students that they should share what they are comfortable with. This is a topic that could be discussed in a future JDCA meeting (and there may be a session on this topic at the Annual Education Conference in Vancouver).

\*\*\*

At the end of the meeting, I reminded members that this meeting was our final JDCA quarterly meeting for this 2022-2023 term. I also reminded members that there will likely be a JDCA meeting at the Annual Education Conference in Vancouver so if you plan to attend, please go and meet each other in person.

Last, I asked the group if anyone was interested in serving as the JDCA chair next year and, if they are interested, to please message/e-mail me. Since this February 2, 2023 JDCA meeting, I have recommended current JDCA Work Group Vice Chair Tom Lee (Penn State Dickinson Law) to serve as a JDCA Section Chair for the next term and he has accepted the role for next year.

## II. JDCA WORKGROUPS

The following are updates on the JDCA workgroups provided by each workgroup’s vice chair(s):

### 1. Annual Education Conference / Bulletin+ Article and Webinar Planning (Vice Chair(s): Tom Lee, Penn State Dickinson Law, [tlee@psu.edu](mailto:tlee@psu.edu))

Tom helped to solicit six article proposals and one webinar program. Prior to the July 18th deadline, JD Career Advisors submitted its proposed Bulletin+ articles to NALP’s Andrew Parker. Mary Beal approved the proposed webinar, which is slated for early 2023. Three of the proposed articles are “nuts and bolts” pieces that are 500-700 words in length. The other three articles are feature length articles that run up to 1000 words in length. Tom has not heard from Andrew Parker as to which month each article is scheduled for publication, if any. The webinar is scheduled for less than one hour.

#### Summary of the JD Career Advisor Articles and Webinar

##### Articles and Columns

Author(s) Name, Email	Topic
Carole Tillotson (Drake) <a href="mailto:carole.tillotson@drake.edu">carole.tillotson@drake.edu</a>	Resumes, Cover Letters and Diversity Statements—what employers want and what schools see (recruiting co-authors)
Dina Billan (Baltimore) <a href="mailto:dbillian@ubalt.edu">dbillian@ubalt.edu</a>	Counsel Students and Alumni to Be Their Own Staffing Agency (seeks co-author)
Dina Billan (Baltimore) <a href="mailto:dbillian@ubalt.edu">dbillian@ubalt.edu</a>	Encouraging the Use of Positive Psychology in the Job Search Process (seeks co-author)

##### Feature Articles

Author(s) Name, Email	Topic
Betsy Key (Vanderbilt) <a href="mailto:elizabeth.b.key@vanderbilt.edu">elizabeth.b.key@vanderbilt.edu</a> ; Cliff Jarrett (W&L) <a href="mailto:jarrettc@wlu.edu">jarrettc@wlu.edu</a>	Mock interview program, and my article idea is to contrast two different programs – Vanderbilt and W&L – as a discussion around the impact of how these programs are structured. Vanderbilt is a 1L program offered over winter break and is run like OCI. W&L offers their program over the 1L summer and is structured for students to reach out to their chosen alumnus on their own, meeting professionals in the market the student is spending the summer.

Christopher Neal, Esq. (Temple); Tammy O'Hara (NYLS) christopher.neal@temple.edu; tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu	The Life-Cycle for Career Advising First Generation Law Students
Amy Mattock (Georgetown) <a href="mailto:asj6@georgetown.edu">asj6@georgetown.edu</a> [and] co-authors are being recruited.	Pulling Back the Curtain on Law Firm Diversity, Equity & Inclusion: What's Marketing and What's Real? (recruiting co-authors or solo)

## Webinar

Author(s) Name, Email	Topic
George Podolin (William and Mary) [and] panel in formation. <a href="mailto:gppodolin@wm.edu">gppodolin@wm.edu</a>	Webinar based upon George's NALP Bulletin+ article "Working With Students Who Reneg."

### 2. CSO Employer Outreach (Vice Chair: Ruby Sheikh, Georgetown Law, [ris6@georgetown.edu](mailto:ris6@georgetown.edu))

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, no update was provided by this work group.

### 3. JD Counseling (Vice Chair(s): Lorelei Craig, University of Oregon, [lcraig@uoregon.edu](mailto:lcraig@uoregon.edu), and Katie Shaw Rabinowitz, Colorado Law, [Katie.Rabinowitz@Colorado.edu](mailto:Katie.Rabinowitz@Colorado.edu)) (formerly Temple Law)

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, no update was provided by this work group.

### 4. First Generation College Students (Vice Chair(s): Tammy O'Hara, New York Law School, [tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu](mailto:tammy.o'hara@nyls.edu), and Chris Neal, Temple Law School, [christopher.neal@temple.edu](mailto:christopher.neal@temple.edu))

Chris Neal is continuing to work on writing the article that was selected for the Bulletin and is due April 14, 2023.

### 5. JD Advantage Careers (Vice Chair(s): Quaime Lee, Northeastern University School of Law, [q.lee@northeastern.edu](mailto:q.lee@northeastern.edu), and Kathy Greenier, University of Richmond, [kgreenier@richmond.edu](mailto:kgreenier@richmond.edu))

During this period, this work group held a meeting on February 15, 2023, plus subsections of the work group that are focused on executing the work group's three charges also held their own meetings, as follows: The subgroup focused on a second JD Advantage Career Week for spring or fall 2023 met on February 13, 2023; the subgroup working on organizing and delivering a program

on advisor wellness/well-being for spring 2023 met on February 14, 2023; and the subgroup planning and executing an update to the 2020 [NALP JD Advantage Career Guide](#) met as well.

At the work group meeting on February 15, 2023, the meeting attendees discussed the following: 1) advertised [a poll](#) to find possible dates and times for an informal gathering at the upcoming Annual Education Conference (AEC) in Vancouver; 2) reviewed the dates, times, and titles of the Conference sessions featuring work group members; and 3) provided updates on workgroup charges.

The update on work group charges is as follows:

(1) A second JD Advantage Career Week for spring 2023:

During their meeting on February 13, 2023, this subgroup decided to revisit planning in May, after the AEC in Vancouver, during which there will be a session encouraging law school members to create their own JD Advantage Career Week programming. Subgroup volunteers want to make sure their programming would complement, not duplicate, whatever arises from the AEC.

(2) An update to the [2020 NALP JD Advantage Career Guide](#)

(3) Organizing and delivering a program on advisor wellness/well-being for spring 2023

This subgroup is pleased to virtually host ICF and Professional Excellence in Coaching certified career leadership coach Emily Hirsekorn for a restorative session on advisor well-being on Wednesday, April 12 at 11amPST/2pm EST. Emily is owner of Hirsekorn Coaching LLC and brings over 10 years of combined law practice, career advising, and leadership experience to her clients with training sessions like, “Finding Fulfillment in Your Law Career without Burning Out”. With 2023 off to a busy start, carve out this time for YOU to focus on authentic leadership while making space for work-life balance.

This well-being program may take the form of a series, with the first being this particular speaker on April 12, 2023, potentially followed by other well-being speakers at other times in the year.

The next JD Advantage meeting is scheduled for April 12, 2023 at 2 p.m. EST.

**6. Recruitment Tools Evaluation (Vice Chair(s): Lauren Jackson, Howard University School of Law, [lauren.jackson@law.howard.edu](mailto:lauren.jackson@law.howard.edu))**

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, no update was provided by this work group.

**7. UBE Score Portability (Vice Chair(s): Kimberly Underdown of St. Mary's University School of Law, [kunderdown@stmarytx.edu](mailto:kunderdown@stmarytx.edu))**

This document has been updated and submitted for review.

**8. Legal Internship Guide (Vice Chair(s): Marcie Y. Davis, Dedman School of Law, Southern Methodist University, [mydavis@smu.edu](mailto:mydavis@smu.edu), and Tami Diebel, Iowa College of Law, [tami-diebel@uiowa.edu](mailto:tami-diebel@uiowa.edu))**

Tami and Marcie collaborated to draft the Legal Internship Guide. The vice chairs shared the draft with colleagues at different schools and with a corporate employer. They received feedback and incorporated it into their draft. They then circulated the guide to a few other friends and edited and refined as they go, and the vice chairs met one more time. After this meeting, per Alison Ashe-Card's advice, they e-mailed the guide to Mary Beal ([mbeal@nalp.org](mailto:mbeal@nalp.org)) and Fred Thrasher ([fthrasher@nalp.org](mailto:fthrasher@nalp.org)) and copied Alison and Beth Maoui on the email.

As of March 2023, the NALP Legal Internship Guide for Employers has been approved! It will go live on the NALP website on April 6, 2023. Links to legal guidance on pay are included as are thoughts and ideas for appropriate legal projects during the internship period.

**9. Member Relations (Vice Chair(s): Felipe Alonso III, University of Oregon School of Law, [falonso@uoregon.edu](mailto:falonso@uoregon.edu))**

From January 25, 2023 to March 31, 2023, sixteen (16) new members joined the section and two (2) left. The Vice Chair sent an email to all new members welcoming them to the group, inviting them to join the quarterly meetings, directing them to review NALPConnect, and reach out with any questions.

**10. Knowledge Management and Resource Implementation (No Vice Chair volunteers as of 6/27/22)**

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, there are no volunteers for this work group. The stated purpose of this group is to: "Identify top resources relevant to the section and collaborate with the NALP staff to explore location options for the compilation to provide easy access."

Upon the advice of Board Liaison, Alison Ashe-Card, the JDCA co-chairs asked the JDCA work group vice chairs to coordinate with the JDCA co-chairs and Alison to make sure that any resources that they create are made accessible to NALP members. Vice chairs are welcome to share these resources on NALPconnect as well.

**11. DEI Liaison (Vice Chair(s): Nicole Netkin-Collins, Villanova Law, [nicole.netkincollins@law.villanova.edu](mailto:nicole.netkincollins@law.villanova.edu))**

The Diversity Standing Committee met in-person last week in Washington, D.C. (March 23, 2023); Nicole notes that there will be some exciting announcements coming from NALP and the Committee in the coming weeks.

**12. Well-Being Champion ((Vice Chair(s): Kimberly Underdown of St. Mary's University School of Law, [kunderdown@stmarytx.edu](mailto:kunderdown@stmarytx.edu))**

Wellness Circle has been brought back by Kendra Brodin. She will be hosting one in April and in May. The JDA Work Group will also be hosting a wellness program for career advisors on April 12. I have encouraged members of my other groups to attend.

### **13. Communications, Social Media & Marketing (No Vice Chair volunteers as of 6/27/22)**

As of the date of this Quarterly Report, there are no volunteers for this work group. Note that no Vice Chairs served in this role in 2021-2022. The stated purpose of this group is to: “Develop at least four (quarterly) social media posts to share with the NALP staff and conduct monthly member outreach on NALPconnect to update the membership about the work of the group.”

Upon the advice of Board Liaison, Alison Ashe-Card, the JDCA co-chairs encouraged the JDCA work group vice chairs to post what their work group is doing on NALPconnect. As of the date of this Quarterly Report, there was a total of 11 posts by the JDCA co-chairs and vice chairs on NALPconnect for the quarter.

### **III. ENVIRONMENTAL SCANNING**

Between the February 2, 2023 JDCA meeting and this report, the following JD career advising topics and issues were discussed and/or shared:

- See the topics discussed on pgs. 2-4 above.
- Some schools have expressed concern with biglaw firms interviewing 1Ls for 1L diversity positions before they receive their 1L fall grades. Then after the student receives their grades and the grades are below the firm’s required minimum GPA, the firm either immediately loses interest in the student or conducts an interview that does not feel like not a “real” interview but a formality. Can firms with minimum GPA requirements hold off on interviewing 1Ls until after they receive their fall grades so they do not waste the students’ time as well as distract students during their first semester of law school exams.
- There are school fears over very early “precruting” for summer 2024. Some biglaw firms have opened their 2L summer associate positions in March (and some have even begun conducting interviews with 1Ls for summer 2024 positions). Schools are concerned that this is distracting to 1Ls in the spring semester. Also, if these firms make offers to 1Ls, how long will students have to decide? Will students be able to participate in summer OCI to explore all of the options. Some schools have highlighted that this precruting is particularly worrisome for first gen students.

### **IV. WORK GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS TO NALP**

See the work group recommendations included in the NALP JD Career Advisors Section Third Quarterly Report dated February 1, 2023.